

Choose **ONE** of the following:

Conley, D and Rauscher, E. (2013) “The Effect of Daughters on Partisanship and Social Attitudes toward Women”, *Sociological Forum*, 28, 4, 700-18.

Rivera, L. and Tilcsik, A. (2016) “Class Advantage, Commitment Penalty: The Gendered Effect of Social Class Signals in an Elite Labor Market”, *American Sociological Review*, 81, 6, 1097-1131.

Raab, M. (2017) “Childhood Family Structure and Early Family Formation in East and West Germany”, *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 79, 110-130

Your Critical Essay should be no longer than 2500 words. References are **NOT** included in the word count.

A number of people have sent me lists of questions about the Critical Essay. Rather than answer individually, which would amount to giving some candidates private information not available to other candidates, I address some common concerns here:

Q. In the introduction, should we summarize what the article is about, explain the structure of our critical assessment and give a first general assessment about the article? **A.** Introductions are always good and a short summary of what the article is about can't be wrong.

Q. Should we have a proper conclusion summarizing our arguments and giving a final evaluation? **A.** Again this can't be wrong.

Q. Should we use sub-headings? **A.** Use any convenient devices you like to make your thoughts clear.

Q. If we refer to something from your slides, do we have to cite you? **A.** No. My slides are not a generally acknowledged authoritative source.

Q. Are there any examples of journal reviews that we can refer to. **A.** Possibly, but I've not looked for them. On the whole, for obvious reasons, academic reviewers don't tend to put their reviews in the public domain.

Q. Am I directing my comments to the journal's editor or at the article's author? **A.** Both, but primarily to the editor. You are giving the editor the benefit of your scientific judgment in order to help her make a decision about the scientific worth of the manuscript.

Q. Am I making a recommendation at the end as to whether or not the article should be/have been published? Am I making a recommendation as to whether or not other academics ought to spend their time reading the article? Am I making a comment about the article's overall contribution to the literature/our knowledge about the subject? **A.** All of these things.