

**University of Oxford**

Department of Sociology

HT 2019

**Social Stratification**

Thursday, weeks 1-8, 14.00-15.30

Manor Road, Seminar Room E

**Summative assessment:** Three hour examination in TT.

**Formative assessment:** Three tutorial essays, two short (1500 words) due Thursday Week 4 and Thursday Week 7. One long (3000 words) due Monday week 1 of TT. You may choose your titles from the list of questions under each topic heading, or you may choose relevant questions from past examination papers, or you may make up your own questions. If you choose the latter please consult me about the suitability of what you propose to do.

**Seminars**

Each week the reading is divided up into two sections (except in Weeks 7 & 8) usually on different, though related, themes or split between more theoretical/conceptual papers and more empirical papers. Each week one person will take responsibility for introducing in the seminar the reading required for each section (ie two people per week). In the seminar they should be prepared to talk for 10 minutes (no more please!) about the main themes or results. Ten minutes is not very long, so you will have to be very selective. You don't have to summarize the reading. Assume that everyone has read the articles, but try to pull out what is important from what is just detail or irrelevance. Try not to read a script from a piece of paper. Just prepare some bullet points and something to say about each one. No Powerpoint presentations please!

In addition each week everyone, of course, should do as much of the reading as is humanly possible. I understand that there is a lot to get through so I'm realistic about how much you will be able to handle. As a guide anyone who doesn't manage to carefully read at least 4 articles per week is a slacker. The main reading for the week is marked with an \* and that is what, at a minimum, the presentation givers should concentrate on.

And finally, to help me focus the seminar on the things that will be most helpful to you, everyone, apart from the presentation givers, is obliged to send me by 14.00 on the Wednesday before the seminar at least 2 questions/comments on the readings that they would like us to discuss.

## Seminar Reading

### Week 2: Cultural Capital and Educational Achievement

i) *There are different opinions about the analytical value and coherence of Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital. The following are some contrasting views. Which do you find most convincing?*

\*Bourdieu, P. (1986) 'The Forms of Capital.' In Richardson, J. E. (ed.) *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* 'This can be difficult to get hold of but a bit of searching can usually turn up a copy of dubious provenance. For example it is currently accessible at:

<https://faculty.georgetown.edu/irvinem/theory/Bourdieu-Forms-of-Capital.pdf>

\*Goldthorpe, J. H. (2007) "'Cultural Capital': Some Critical Observations' *Sociologica*, 2. doi: 10.2383/24755. This article appears in an on-line journal which can be accessed after registration. Registration is free.

\*Goldthorpe, J. H. (2008) 'Three cheers for unoriginality – but who will be cheering?' *Sociologica*, 1. doi: 10.2383/26581.

\*Lizardo, O. (2008) 'Comment on John Goldthorpe/5. Three cheers for unoriginality.' *Sociologica*, 1. doi:10.2383/26580.

Lareau, A. and Weininger, E. B. (2003) 'Cultural Capital in Educational Research: A Critical Assessment.' *Theory and Society*, 32, pp. 567-606.

Sullivan, A. (2002) 'Bourdieu and Education: How Useful is Bourdieu's Theory for Researchers?' *Netherlands Journal of Social Science*, 38, 2, 144-166.

Weininger, E. B. (2005) 'Foundations of Pierre Bourdieu's Class Analysis.' In Wright, E. O. (ed.) *Approaches to Class Analysis*. This chapter is downloadable from Erik Wright's website: <http://www.ssc.wisc.edu/~wright/Chapter%204%20--%20Weininger%20Jan%202004doc.pdf>

Savage, M., Warde, A. and F. Devine (2005) 'Capitals, assets and resources: some critical issues' *British Journal of Sociology*, 56, 1, pp 31-47.

Lareau, A. (2002) 'Invisible Inequality: Social Class and Childrearing in Black Families and White Families', *American Sociological Review*, 67, 5, 747-776.

Weininger, E. B. and Lareau, A. (2003) 'Translating Bourdieu into the American context: the question of social class and family-school relations' *Poetics*, 31, 375-402.

Weininger, E. B. and Lareau, A. (2009) 'Paradoxical Pathways: An Ethnographic Extension of Kohn's Findings on Class and Childrearing' *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 71, 680-695.

ii) *Attempts to estimate the impact of cultural capital or cultural resources on educational outcomes have reached mixed conclusions. What does the balance of the evidence tell us?*

De Graaf, N. D., De Graaf, P. and Kraaykamp, G. (2000) 'Parental Cultural Capital and Educational Attainment in the Netherlands: A Refinement of the Cultural Capital Perspective' *Sociology of Education*, 73, 2, pp. 92-111.

DiMaggio, P. and Mohr, J. (1985) 'Cultural capital, educational attainment and marital selection.' *American Journal of Sociology* 90, 6 (May).

\*DiMaggio, P. (1982) 'Cultural Capital and High School Success: The Impact of Status Culture Participation on the Grades of US High School Students.' *American Sociological Review*, 47, pp. 189-201.

\*Jaeger, M. M. and Breen, R. (2016) 'A Dynamic Model of Cultural Reproduction', *American Journal of Sociology*, 12, 4, 1079-1115.

It will help you to understand what Jaeger and Breen (2016) are doing if you read: Halaby, C. (2004) 'Panel Models in Sociological Research: Theory into Practice' *Annual Review of Sociology*, 30, 507-44, especially from pp 535 onwards.\*Jaeger, M. M. (2011) 'Does Cultural Capital Really Affect Academic Achievement? New Evidence from Combined Sibling and Panel Data.' *Sociology of Education*, 4, pp. 281-298.

Jaeger, M. M. (2009) 'Equal Access but Unequal Outcomes: Cultural Capital and Educational Choice in a Meritocratic Society.' *Social Forces*, 4, pp. 1943-1971.

\*Van de Werfhorst, H. G. and Hofstede, S. (2007) 'Cultural Capital or Relative Risk Aversion? Two Mechanisms for Educational Inequality Compared', *British Journal of Sociology*, 58, 391-415.

### **Week 3: Social Inequality & Child Development**

i) *The Feinstein debate. Is inequality reinforced as children develop?*

The initial paper is:

\*Feinstein, L. (2003) 'Inequality in the Early Cognitive Development of British Children in the 1970 Cohort', *Economica*, 70, 73-97.

Feinstein, L (2003) 'Very Early', *CentrePiece*, Summer, 24-30. (This is a popular version of the *Economica* article)

The first serious critique is:

\*Jerrim, J. and Vignoles, A. (2011) The use (and misuse) of statistics in understanding social mobility: regression to the mean and the cognitive development of high ability children from disadvantaged homes. DoQSS Working Paper No. 11-01. Downloadable at: <http://repec.ioe.ac.uk/REPEc/pdf/qsswp1101.pdf>

\*Subsequently the debate has been pursued in the pages of *Longitudinal and Lifecourse Studies*, 2015, 6, 3, 331-376

Feinstein has the final word in *Longitudinal and Lifecourse Studies*, 2015, 6, 4, 476-483.

The following give important technical background information at lesser and greater length:

Healy, M. J. R. and Goldstein, H. (1978) 'Regression to the Mean', *Annals of Human Biology*, 5, 3, 277-280.

Nesselroade, J. R., Stigler, S. M. and Baltes, P. B. (1980) 'Regression Toward the Mean and the Study of Change' *Psychological Bulletin*, 88, 3, 622-637.

ii) *Should the evidence lead us to be pessimistic about the possibility of breaking the link between inter-generational inequality?*

Ermisch, J. (2008) 'Origins of Social Immobility and Inequality: Parenting and Early Child Development', *National Institute Economic Review*, 205, 62-71.

\*Becker, B. (2011) 'Social disparities in children's vocabulary in early childhood. Does pre-school education help to close the gap?' *British Journal of Sociology*, 62, 1, 69-88.

\*Sullivan, A., Sosthenes, K. and Joshi, H. (2013) 'Social Class and Inequalities in Early Cognitive Scores' *Sociology*, 47, 1187-1206.

Rasbash, J. Leckie, G. and Pillinger, R. (2010) 'Children's educational progress: partitioning family, school and area effects' *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society, Series A*, 173, 3, 657-682.

#### **Week 4: Social Class**

i) *What is social class? Are some conceptualisations of social class more helpful than others? How could we know?*

\*Goldthorpe, J. H. (2000) 'Social class and the differentiation of employment contracts' Ch. 10 of *On Sociology*

Goldthorpe, J.H. and McKnight, A. (2006) 'The economic basis of social class' in Morgan, S. L., Grusky, D. B. and Fields, G. S. (eds.) *Mobility and Inequality*

McGovern P. et al. (2007) *Market Class and Employment*, pp. 70-87

Williams, M. T. (2016) 'An Old Model of Social Class? Job Characteristics and the NS-SEC Schema', *Work Employment and Society*, OnlineFirst

Sørensen, A. (2005) 'Foundations of neo-Ricardian class analysis' in Wright, E. O. (ed.) *Approaches to Class Analysis*. Available at: <http://www.ssc.wisc.edu/~wright/Chapter%205%20--%20Sorensen%20Jan%202004.pdf>

Wright, E. O. (2005) 'Foundations of a neo-Marxist Class Analysis' in Wright, E. O. (ed.) *Approaches to Class Analysis*. Available at: <http://www.ssc.wisc.edu/~wright/Chapter%201%20-%20Wright%20Jan%202004.pdf>

Wright, E. O. (2015) From Grand Paradigm Battles to Pragmatic Realism: Towards and Integrated Class Analysis in Wright E. O. (2015) *Understanding Class*.

\*Wright E. O. (2015) The Shadow of Exploitation in Weber's Class Analysis in Wright, E. O. (2015) *Understanding Class*.

Western, B., Bloome, D., Sosnaud, B. and Tach, L. (2012) 'Economic Insecurity and Social Stratification', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 38, 341-59

Rehm, P. (2009) 'Risks and Redistribution: An Individual Level Analysis', *Comparative Political Studies*, 42, 855-

Bengtsson, M., Berglund, T. and Oskarson, M. (2013) 'Class and ideological orientations revisited: an exploration of class-based mechanisms', *British Journal of Sociology*, 64, 4, 691-716.

Pahl, R. (1993) 'Does class analysis without class theory have a promising future? A reply to Goldthorpe and Marshall', *Sociology*, 27, 2, 253-258.

Le Roux, B., Rouanet, H., Savage, M. and Warde, A. (2008) 'Class and Cultural Division in the UK' *Sociology*, 42, pp.1049-1071.

\*Savage et al. (2013) 'A New Model of Social Class? Findings from the BBC's Great British Class Survey Experiment' *Sociology* 47,2, 219-250.

Atkinson, W. and Rosenlund L. (2014) 'Mapping the British Social Space: Towards a Bourdieusian Class Scheme' [http://www.bristol.ac.uk/media-library/sites/spais/documents/Working%20paper\\_02\\_14\\_WA.pdf](http://www.bristol.ac.uk/media-library/sites/spais/documents/Working%20paper_02_14_WA.pdf)

ii) *Should we replace 'big classes with 'micro-classes?*

\*Weeden, K. A., and Grusky, D. B. (2005). 'The Case for a New Class Map' *American Journal of Sociology* 111, 1, 141-212.

Grusky, D. B., and Weeden, K. A. (2008) 'Are there Social Classes? A Framework for Testing Sociology's Favorite Concept' pp. 65-89 in *Social Class: How Does it Work?*, Lareau A. and Conley, D. (eds.)

\*Jonsson, J. O., Grusky, D. B., Di Carlo, M., Pollak, R. and Brinton, M. C. (2009) 'Microclass mobility: Social reproduction in four countries', *American Journal of Sociology*, 93, 6, 1358-1400.

\*Erikson, R., Goldthorpe, J. H. and Hällsten, M. (2012) 'No way back up from ratcheting down? A critique of the 'microclass' approach to the analysis of social mobility', *Acta Sociologica*, 55, 3, 211-229.

Williams, M. (2012) 'Occupations and British Wage Inequality, 1970s-2000s', *European Sociological Review*, 29, 6.

Weeden, K. A. (2002) 'Why do some occupations pay more than others? Social closure and earnings inequality in the United States.' *American Journal of Sociology*, 108, 55-101.

Kim, C. and Sakamoto, A. (2008). 'The rise of intra-occupational wage inequality in the United States, 1983 to 2002'. *American Sociological Review*, 73, 129-157.

Wright, E. O. (2015) Occupations as Micro-classes: David Grusky and Kim Weeden's Reconfiguration of Class Analysis in Wright, E. O (2015) *Understanding Class*.

## **Week 5: Social Mobility 1.**

i) *What is social mobility? Why is it of any interest? Has social mobility in Britain declined?*

\*Bukodi, Erzsebet, Goldthorpe, J., Waller, L. and Kuha, J. (2015) 'The mobility problem in Britain: New Findings from the Analysis of Birth Cohort Data' , *British Journal of Sociology*, 66, 1, 93-117.

Breen, R. Mood, C. and Jonsson, J. O. (2016) 'How Much Scope for a Mobility Paradox? The Relationship between Social and Income Mobility in Sweden' *Sociological Science*, DOI 10.15195/v3.a3

\*Blanden, J., A. Goodman, P. Gregg and S. Machin (2004) "Changes in Intergenerational Mobility in Britain" in Corak, M. (ed.) *Generational Income Inequality*

Bukodi, E and John H. Goldthorpe (2018) *Social Mobility and Education in Britain: Research, Politics and Policy*.

Chetty, R, Grusky, D. Hell, M., Hendren, N., Manduca, R and Narang, J., The Fading American Dream: trends in Absolute Income Mobility Since 1940 [http://www.equality-of-opportunity.org/papers/abs\\_mobility\\_paper.pdf](http://www.equality-of-opportunity.org/papers/abs_mobility_paper.pdf)

Goldthorpe, J. H. and C. Mills (2008) Class Trends in Intergenerational Class Mobility in Modern Britain: Evidence From National Surveys, 1972—2005, *National Institute Economic Review*

Blanden, J., Gregg, P. and Machin, S. (2005) 'Educational Inequality and Intergenerational Mobility' in S. Machin and A. Vignoles (eds.) *What's the Good of Education? The Economics of Education in the UK*, pp: 99-114.

Blanden, J. A., P. Gregg and L. Macmillan (2007) "Accounting for Intergenerational Persistence", *Economic Journal*, 117, (519), C43-C60

Blanden, J. and Machin, S. (2007) Recent Changes in Intergenerational Mobility in Britain, Report for the Sutton Trust, December.

Blanden, J., Gregg, P. and Machin, S. (2005) 'Educational Inequality and Intergenerational Mobility' in S. Machin and A. Vignoles (eds.) *What's the Good of Education? The Economics of Education in the UK*, pp: 99-114.

Blanden J., A. and S. Machin (2008) “Up and Down the Generational Income Ladder in Britain: Past Changes and Future Prospects” *National Institute Economic Review*

\*Erikson, R. And Goldthorpe, J. H. (2010) “Has social mobility in Britain decreased? Reconciling divergent findings on income and class mobility”, *British Journal of Sociology*, 61, 2, 211-230

Goldthorpe, J. H. (2016) ‘Social class mobility in modern Britain: changing structure, constant process’, *Journal of the British Academy*, 4, 89-111.

Mitnik, P. A., Bryant, V. Weber, M. and Grusky, D. B. (2015) New Estimates of Intergenerational Mobility Using Administrative Data, <https://www.irs.gov/pub/irs-soi/15rpintergenmobility.pdf>

\*Swift, A. (2004) ‘Would perfect mobility be perfect?’ *European Sociological Review*, 20, 1, 1-11.

Swift, A. and Marshal, G. (1997) ‘Meritocratic Equality of Opportunity: Economic Efficiency, Social Justice, or Both?’ *Policy Studies*, 18, 1, 1997.

ii) *What, if anything, have we learned from cross-national comparisons of social mobility?*

Breen, R. (ed.) (2005) *Social Mobility in Europe*.

\*Blanden, J. A. (2011) “Cross-country rankings in intergenerational mobility: a comparison of approaches from economics and sociology” *Journal of Economic Surveys* DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-6419.2011.00690.x

\*Jerrim, J., Choi, A. and Rodriguez, R. S. (2013) Cross-national comparisons of intergenerational mobility: are the earnings measured used robust? Working Paper. Downloadable from: [https://editorialexpress.com/cgi-bin/conference/download.cgi?db\\_name=XXIEEP&paper\\_id=73](https://editorialexpress.com/cgi-bin/conference/download.cgi?db_name=XXIEEP&paper_id=73)

## **Week 6: Genetics and social stratification**

*Why should a social scientist be interested in genetics?*

\*Benjamin, D. (2012) ‘The Promise and Pitfalls of Genoeconomics’, *Annual Review of Economics*, 4, 627-62.

\*Conley, D. (2016) ‘Socio-Genomic Research Using Genome-Wide Molecular Data’, *Annual Review of Sociology*.

\*Freese, Jeremy (2008) ‘Genetics and the Social Science Explanation of Individual Outcomes’, *American Journal of Sociology*, 114 Suppl. S1-S35.

\*Freese, J. and S. Shostak (2009) ‘Genetics and Social Inquiry’, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 35, 107-28.

Lewontin, R. (1974/2006) 'The analysis of variance and the analysis of causes', *International Journal of Epidemiology*, 35, 520-525.

Plomin R. (2018) *Blueprint: How DNA Makes Us Who We Are*.

Conley, D. and J. Fletcher (2017) *The Genome Factor; What the Social Genomics Revolution Reveals about Ourselves, Our History and the Future*.

*Have GWAS and/or twin studies increased our understanding of social stratification?*

\*Ayorech, Z. Krapohl, E. Plomin, R. and S. von Stumm (2017) 'Genetic Influence on Intergenerational Educational Attainment', *Psychological Science*, 28, 9, 1302-1310.

Chabris, C. F. et al. (2012) 'Most Reported Genetic Associations with General Intelligence are Probably False Positives', *Psychological Science*, 23, 11, 1314-1323.

\*Conley, D. and B. Domingue (2016) 'The Bell Curve Revisited: Testing Controversial Hypotheses with Molecular Genetic Data', *Sociological Science*, 3, 520-539.

\*Lyngstad, T. H., Ystrøm, E. and I. Zambrana (2018) An Anatomy of Intergenerational Transmission: Learning from the Educational Attainments of Norwegian Twins and their Parents. <https://osf.io/preprints/socarxiv/fby2t/>

\*Plomin, R. and S. von Stumm (2018) 'The new genetics of intelligence' *Nature Reviews Genetics*, 19, March, 148-159.

## **Week 7: Location, location, location...**

*How much do neighbourhoods matter?*

\*Brooks-Gunn, J., Duncan, G. T., Klebanov, P. K. and N. Sealand (1993) 'Do Neighborhoods Influence Child and Adolescent Development?' *American Journal of Sociology*, 99, 2, 353-395.

\*Sharkey, P. and Faber, J. W. (2014) 'Where, When, Why, and For Whom Do Residential Context Matter? Moving Away from the Dichotomous Understanding of Neighborhood Effects', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 40, 559-79.

Chetty, R. and Hendren, N. (2015) 'The Impacts of Neighborhoods on Intergenerational Mobility: Childhood Exposure Effects and County-Level Estimates' Working Paper downloadable from: <http://www.rajchetty.com/index.php/papers-and-data/papers-and-data-listed-chronologically>

Chetty, R., Hendren, N., Kline, P. and E. Saez (2014) 'Where is the Land of Opportunity? The Geography of Intergenerational Mobility in the United States', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 129, 4, 1553-1623.

Sharkey, P. and Faber, J. W. (2014) 'Where, When, Why, and For Whom Do Residential Context Matter? Moving Away from the Dichotomous Understanding of Neighborhood Effects', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 40, 559-79.

\*Sharkey, P.(2008) 'The Intergenerational Transmission of Context' *American Journal of Sociology*, 113, 4, 931-69.

Sharkey, P. (2012) 'Residential Mobility and the Reproduction of Unequal Neighborhoods', *Cityscape: A Journal of Policy Development and Research*, 14, 3, 9-32

Sharkey, P. (2012) 'An Alternative Approach to Addressing Selection Into and Out of Social Settings: Neighborhood Change and African American Children's Economic Outcomes', *Sociological Methods & Research*, 41, 2, 251-293.

Sharkey, P. and Elwert, F. (2011) 'The Legacy of Disadvantage: Multigenerational Neighborhood Effects on Cognitive Ability', *American Journal of Sociology*, 116, 6, 1934-81.

## **Week 8: Social Mobility in the Long Run**

*How much social mobility is there over long periods of time?*

Clark, G. (2015) *The Son also Rises: Surnames and the History of Social Mobility*.

\*Clark et al. (2014) Surnames a New Source for the History of Social Mobility  
<http://faculty.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/gclark/The%20Son%20Also%20Rises/EEH%202014.pdf>

\*Clark G. and N. Cummins (2013) Surnames and Social Mobility. England 1230-2012.  
[http://faculty.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/gclark/The%20Son%20Also%20Rises/Clark\\_Cummins\\_HN.pdf](http://faculty.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/gclark/The%20Son%20Also%20Rises/Clark_Cummins_HN.pdf)

\*Clark, G. (2013) Intergenerational Wealth Mobility in England, 1858-2012. Surnames and Social Mobility.)  
<http://faculty.econ.ucdavis.edu/faculty/gclark/The%20Son%20Also%20Rises/Clark%20Cummins%201858-2012%202014-2.pdf>

\*Torche, F. and A. Corvalan (2016) 'Estimating Intergenerational Mobility with Grouped Data: A Critique of Clark's the Son Also Rises', *Sociological Methods and Research*.

\*Solon, G. (2017) What Do We Know So Far about Multigenerational Mobility? IZA Discussion Paper Series <http://ftp.iza.org/dp10623.pdf>

## Schedule for class presentations (the 10 minute introductions)

### Week 2

- i) *There are different opinions about the analytical value and coherence of Bourdieu's concept of cultural capital. The following are some contrasting views. Which do you find most convincing?*
- ii) *Attempts to estimate the impact of cultural capital or cultural resources on educational outcomes have reached mixed conclusions. What does the balance of the evidence tell us?*

### Week 3

- i) *The Feinstein debate. Is inequality reinforced as children develop?*
- ii) *Should the evidence lead us to be pessimistic about the possibility of breaking the link between inter-generational inequality?*

### Week 4

- i) *What is social class? Are some conceptualisations of social class more helpful than others? How could we know?*
- ii) *Should we replace 'big classes with 'micro-classes?*

### Week 5

- i) *What is social mobility? Why is it of any interest? Has social mobility in Britain declined?*
- ii) *What, if anything, have we learned from cross-national comparisons of social mobility?*

### Week 6

- i) *Why should a social scientist be interested in genetics?*
- ii) *Have GWAS and/or twin studies increased our understanding of social stratification?*

### Week 7

- i) *How much do neighbourhoods matter?*

### Week 8

- i) *How much social mobility is there over long periods of time?*